



2015

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT
(*REVISED)

Thursday, July 23, 2015,
4th Floor Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701

1. Call to Order / Roll Call:

Meeting called to session at 1:02 PM

Commissioners: Terry Majewski (Chair), Arthur Stables, Sharon Chadwick, Jim Sauer, Patsy Waterfall

Staff: Michael Taku, Gerald Goodman (PDSD), Jennifer Levstik, Lynne Birkinbine (OIP)

2. Approval of Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 7-9-15

Motion by Commissioner Waterfall to approve the Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 7-9-15. Motion seconded by Commissioner Stables.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

- a. HPZ-15-40 - Pima County Urban Loop and Bank Protection Project - Archaeological Data Recovery - Pantano Wash between Tanque Verde Road and Fort Lowell Park - 5802 East Fort Lowell Road (Fort Lowell)**

Staff Taku provided background and read the Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board (FLHZAB) legal action report into the record with a unanimous recommendation to approve plan as presented and verifying that all plantings are native/certified, to remove invasive plants and return to FLHZAB with more details on the interpretative signs.

Presentation by Courtney Rose, Project Manager and Larry Robinson, District Project Manager on the Urban Loop project along the Pantano between Tanque Verde Rd and Ft. Lowell Park. Presentation focused on scope of work, chronology of events, site use, archeological assessment and sites, artifacts to be collected and analyzed and revision of project due to sensitivity to the historic properties and the Ft. Lowell Master Plan.

The proposed pathway is also located along the eastern boundary of the Hardy site within the COT parcel. The project aims to provide bank protection to residents, businesses, infrastructure, provide recreational amenities and alternative transportation including a continuous all-weather pedestrian path. Additionally, provide a staging area at Glenn Street, seating area to have a beautiful scenic view. Proposed built facilities include a paved, multi-use path, decomposed granite path, and concrete plaza with slump block adobe columns and interpretative signage on the archeology and history of Ft. Lowell. Phase 2 of the project will follow with consultation and approval from City of Tucson, State Historic Preservation Office and the Native American Tribes.

Commissioners discussion was on tree species and opined that native species be used as much as possible; access around Tanque Verde bridge; lack of parking area due to topography and irrigation of plants to be via reclaimed water.

Motion by Commissioner Chadwick to recommend approval as presented and all plantings are native/certified, invasive plants be removed and to return to Fort Lowell and PRS with more details on the interpretative signs and/or any significant revisions to the presented plan. Seconded by Commissioner Stables.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

b. HPZ-15-52 Olson-Garewal Residence - Replace Roof/Porch Addition/Access Ramp - 537 South 4th Avenue (Armory Park)

Staff Taku provided background and read the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) legal action report into the record with a recommendation to approve plans as submitted.

Leo Kartz, Architect, presented on behalf of the property owner, Kristin Olson Garewal. The project consists of reinforcing roof with asphalt shingles; a new porch with powder room/storage; handicap access ramp and arched spandrels to front porch.

Motion by Commissioner Sauer to recommend approval of the plans as presented and building setbacks be waived. Seconded by Commissioner Waterfall.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

c. HPZ-15-53 - Munic Enterprises - Remodel/Veneer/Windows/Door Replacements [Zoning Violation] - 843 South 2nd Avenue (Armory Park)

Staff Taku provided background and read the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) legal action report into the record with recommendations to approve plans as submitted with conditions: (1) the height of the new south window be brought down so that it matches the north window as per the pre-existing plans, and that the large window space be filled with two wood double hung windows of the same proportionality, material and style of the existing windows; (2) the changed door, the size of the enlarged space may remain, but the door must be changed to resemble a more appropriate door – this would involve filling in the bottom two windows in the door, removing the mullion from between the top two windows and turning that into one large window like many in the neighborhood; and, (3) stucco the block wall in front to match the house and place the same caps on the pillars as are on the small rock wall closer to the house.

Presentation by Rochelle Rubin assisting the property owner John Munic to abate a zoning violation for the removal and replacement of windows and a door on the front of the house without historic review. An emergency minor review was conducted to all allow a temporary installation of a door to secure items in the house.

Commissioners' discussion focused on how best to make the new large single window and enlarged door space to be a good fit in the neighborhood. Mindful that this is an infill project to the Armory Park Historic District, was not built as per approved 2005 plans and owner express willing to work on abatement, Commissioners concurred with the conditions of Armory Park recommendations with the addition that no side lights are to be used on the door.

Commissioner Sauer moved, Commissioner Stables seconded to recommend approval of the proposal as presented with same conditions proposed by Armory Park Historic Advisory Board and that no side lights are to be used on the door.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

4. Rio Nuevo District Review Case

a. RND-15-16 - St. Augustine Cathedral Plaza/Saint Augustine Cathedral Roman Catholic Parish Complex - Historic Restoration: Our Lady's Chapel - 192 South Stone Avenue - C-3

Project presented by Kegan Tom, Architect at the Architecture Company. Ms. Tom noted that in 1983 the chapel was remodeled to convert the Chapel into Offices and restroom spaces, added an entry walk to the new

south entrance and closed the north entrance from Ochoa Street. The current project is the historic restoration of the Our Lady's Chapel to its original as built configuration as follows: (1) remove the office addition built in 1983 on the south end of the chapel to return this façade to its original view; (2) use concrete slab on demolished addition to recreate a patio; (3) Add doors on the north entrance to the Chapel; and, (4) construct a new exterior ADA ramp up to the existing exit door on the east wall of the Chapel. All exterior proposed additions will be restored to match the materials, surface textures and colors of the existing structures.

Motion by Commissioner Stables to recommend approval of the project as presented with work described on the plans. Seconded by Commissioner Sauer.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

b. RND-15-17 - The Drawing Studio Building - Façade Improvement: Storefront, Windows, Doors, Awnings and Glass transoms - 33 South 6th Avenue -OCR-2

Architects Rob Bass and Thomas Sayler-Brown presented the proposed façade improvement by: (1) removing the existing sunshades on both sides of the entrance and replacing existing storefront with insulated storefront and retractable awnings; (2) replacing portions of the north wall to match surrounding buildings with access to the Gibson courtyard; (3) removing the opaque panels above 6th Avenue façade storefront and restoring existing lead glass transom windows on each end of the façade with a better performance glass.

Motion by Commissioner Sauer to recommend approval of the project as presented. Seconded by Commissioner Waterfall.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

5 Section 106 Programmatic Agreement Compliance Review

Compass Affordable Housing / Downtown Motor Apartments LLC – Downtown Motor Apartments - 383 South Stone Avenue. – Final Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) regarding the proposed new construction of an affordable housing apartment complex –**Discussion/Action**. (Listed as a contributing property to the Armory Park National Register Historic District and Outside HPZ Boundary)

Chair Majewski provided a summary of the MOA highlighting the role of the plan Review Subcommittee (PRS) as a concurring party and the 30 day public comment period prior to releasing any funding. Chair Majewski and fellow Commissioners would prefer early consultation with the Historic Preservation

Office (HPO) and PRS to be a part of the process not be an afterthought as in this case and for the voices of the preservation community to be considered.

Motion by Commissioner Stables to allow Chair Majewski to write a letter on behalf of PRS for a case of early involvement of PRS and HPO in the process. Seconded by Commissioner Waterfall.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

Motion by Commissioner Stables to encourage Chair Majewski to write a letter on behalf of PRS on why PRS concurs with the MOA and to recommend that she signs as a concurring party to the MOA. Seconded by Commissioner Waterfall.

Motion passed. Vote 4-1 (Commissioner Sauer dissent)

6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:

a. Minor Reviews

Staff Taku updated Subcommittee on minor reviews conducted. On 7/3/15, an emergency onsite review on a stop work order at 843 S. 2nd Avenue.

b. Appeals

Nothing at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff continues to assist on abatement of violations in the Historic Districts.

7. Call to the Audience

No one from the audience present to speak at this time.

8. Future Items

None at this time

9. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 3:00 p.m.